WHERE POVERTY EVIDENCE IS MOST NEEDED: AN EVIDENCE GAP MAP SHOWS WHAT WE KNOW

WEBINAR CHAT TRANSCRIPT

APRIL 09, 2015
Presenters

Martina Vojtková, The International Initiative for Impact Evaluation
Jennifer Stevenson, The International Initiative for Impact Evaluation
Tania Alfonso, USAID/PPL/LER
USAID Agrilinks: Thanks to everyone joining early. We’re just coordinating with the presenters.

Kris merschrod: Randy I copy you. No copy on Martina.

USAID Agrilinks: For Presenters, please use the presenter chat pod to communicate with each other.

Kris merschrod: I copy you Martina.

Anand Manarkattu: I copy you Martina.

Kris merschrod: Probably a good idea to keep IDs straight.

USAID Knowledge Driven Development: Good morning everyone.

USAID Knowledge Driven Development: Please bear with us as we coordinate the audio with our presenters in London.

USAID Knowledge Driven Development: We will be getting started in about 10 minutes.

Zaheer Ahmed: Hi good evening can we see the under discussion slide one by one?

Zaheer Ahmed: Under discussion slide please.

Anand Manarkattu: Hi, I am Anand Manarkattu an MPhil in Planning and Development student at Indian Institute of Technology (IIT) Bombay, India. I am currently researching on development evaluation with respect to the processes involved and how it impacts the decisions.

Lola Hermosillo: Lola Hermosillo from MCC (M&E).

Anne Hastings: I am Anne Hastings, the Executive Director of the Microfinance CEO Working Group.

Susan Rogers: Susan Rogers - Creative Associates International, M&E.

Janice Stallard: Janice Stallard, from Banyan Global in Washington, DC. We are a woman-owned small business international development contractor. We do mostly USAID funded work.

Janine Al-Aseer: Janine Al-Aseer from Knoxville, TN and I am with the Center for Sport, Peace, and Society.

Awoke Tilahun: Awoke Tilahun, USAID/Ethiopia (M&E Specialist).

Megnote Lezhnev: USAID Africa Bureau Education.

Danae Roumis: Danae Roumis, Deputy Director for Impact Evaluation at Social Impact.

Kris merschrod: GM Kris here in Ithaca, NY - Consultant on development project evaluation - been working overseas since 1964.

Todd Anderson: Good morning! My name is Todd Anderson. I currently am a senior analyst at the Government Accountability Office (GAO). My work focuses on monitoring and evaluation of US development assistance programs. Looking forward to the presentation!
USAID Knowledge Driven Development: Good morning Zaheer Ahmed

Shelly Hicks 2: Good Morning all. Shelly Hicks, USAID Measuring Impact Project, Environmental Incentives. Based in DC

USAID Knowledge Driven Development: Could you please clarify your question?

Krisila Benson: Krisila Benson, Senior Director, Program Services for TechnoServe, based in DC.

Krisila Benson: BTW, I am not getting any sound – not sure if that is expected, or signals a problem of some sort.

USAID Knowledge Driven Development: Good morning everyone! Thank you for introducing yourselves!

Marcus Jenal: Hi all, I’m Marcus Jenal from the BEAM Exchange, a knowledge platform on market systems development

Chia Fu: Good morning, Chia Fu, Data solutions architect with State Department, Foreign Policy Analysis Directorate

John Waugh: Good morning. I’m John Waugh, Environment and Natural Resources Practice Manager at Integra LLC (integrallc.com)

USAID Knowledge Driven Development: Hello Marcus, Chia and John! Welcome!

USAID Knowledge Driven Development: We will be getting started in just a couple of minutes!

Ann Hershkowitz: Good morning, Ann Hershkowitz from Education Development Center

George i: George Ingram at Brookings

Kris Merschroed: Hi, this John Dennis, Sustainable Development Associates; I am here with Kris Merschrod

Pramod Sharma: Good Morning

Daniel lauer: Dan Lauer, GHR Foundation

Anna Haines: Good Morning, a team is joining from the MasterCard Foundation based in Toronto.

Alexandra Towns: Good morning, Program Specialist for University Engagement and Research, Catholic Relief Services (Baltimore)

USAID Knowledge Driven Development: Wonderful!

USAID Knowledge Driven Development: Hello to all!

Yejin Oh: Hi all, Yejin Oh at World Vision International - joining from Johannesburg!

Tony Posnett: Tony Posnett, M&E lead on a child labour project in Cambodia

Laura Arntson: Laura Arntson, Sr M&E Advisor with Social Solutions, MECap project, DC

Hiren Nisar: Good Morning, a team from Abt Associates Inc., evaluation group based in Bethesda, MD
Jay Heavner: Director of Communications, JSI/DC

David Leege: David Leege, Director of University Engagement and Research and Catholic Relief Services

Zaheer Ahmed: Hi I am zaheer Ahmed from Pakistan, Student of M.phil Economics my research area is Economic development and population growth currently i am working for SDF as research M&E officer

Themba Nduna: Themba Nduna: Nutrition Advisor USAID Zimbabwe

Amanda ONeil: If you’re on phone - MUTE yourself

Shamiso Matambanadzo: Hi All. Shamiso Matambanadzo at World Vision Zimbabwe- ENSURE Food security program!

John Hembling: John Hembling, Health Research and Evaluation Advisor

SAID Knowledge Driven Development: apologies for the phone noises

SAID Knowledge Driven Development: we are working to mute that sound

John Hembling: Catholic Relief Services


Marc Douglas: Good afternoon, from USAID/Liberia - Marc Douglas

Laura Hughston: Laura Hughston, Learning and impact assessment officer Plan international UK

Pramod Sharma: Pramod Sharma, Livelihood researcher, Madhya Pradesh, India

Natasha Kanagat: Natasha Kanagat, Research and Evaluation Advisor, John Snow, Inc.

Jay Heavner: Hi Natasha

Joseph Thomas: Hi from Joseph Fredrick, World Vision, KRI, Iraq - DME

Julie Peachey: Julie Peachey with Grameen Foundation and the Progress out of Poverty Index (PPI)

Bhavani Pathak: Hello all, Bhavani Pathak, E3/PLC

USAID Knowledge Driven Development: welcome! Thank you everyone for joining

Kathleen Webb: Kathy Webb from the USAID/Zimbabwe Health Office.

USAID Knowledge Driven Development: Please continue to use the chatbox to introduce yourselves, and to pose any questions that you have

Krista Jacobs: Krista Jacobs, USAID/BFS

Awoke Tilahun: I cannot hear

Shannon Wilson: Shannon Wilson, Markets Advisor, USAID Office of Food for Peace

Stephanie Monschein: Stephanie Monschein, M&E Manager, Dexis Consulting Group
Jillian Baker: M&E Manager, MEDA in Toronto:)

Jay Heavner: Can you repeat the hashtag?

Stephanie Dimos: Stephanie Dimos, senior at the College of William and Mary in Williamsburg, VA. I hope to pursue a career in development, particularly aid transparency/M&E.

Bhavani Pathak: #3ieEGM

Stephanie Monschein: #3ieEGM

Jennifer Stevenson (London): #3ieEGM

Jay Heavner: thanks!


Awoke Tilahun: I cannot hear

KDAD AV Tech: Awoke, I just sent you a private message.

Kristina Kempkey: Kristina Kempkey, Global Development Lab/HESN

KDAD AV Tech: Please be sure that you are using firefox or internet explorer and not chrome as your browser.

Susan Roers: By counterfactual do you mean use of RCT design on impact evaluations?

Marcus Jenah: How do you avoid ‘double counting’ of evaluations, i.e. include them directly in the map and indirectly via a systematic review? Could that not over-estimate the availability of evidence?

USAID Knowledge Driven Development: Thank you for submitting your questions!

Tania Alfonso (USAID/PPI/LER): Susan Roes: As per USAID policy impact evaluations have to include a counterfactual but it is possible to estimate a counterfactual with methods other than RCTs

USAID Knowledge Driven Development: Please continue to ask questions for Martina and for Tania

Marcus Jenah: How do you judge the ‘quality’ of evidence? So how can you separate ‘higher’ from ‘lower’ quality?

Megnote Lezhnev: Tina what are the other methods other than RCT for counterfactual?

Marcus Jenah: Why do you only include systematic reviews and impact evaluations, not other types of evidence such as case studies?

Hannah Fitter: I would assume that knowing how much of study findings are context specific would require a great deal of knowledge not only about the context of the place where the study took place, but also where development policy makers are planning to apply lessons learned. How does 3ie ensure that enough local knowledge is possessed?
Zaheer Ahmed: please can you explain the indicator and variable on which basis you measure the poverty trend?

Susan Davis: Many development interventions don't "stick". How do these maps account for backsliding or project failure?

Laura Arntson: Similar to the question on local knowledge, projections do not appear to include influences beyond the manageable interest of interventions

Hannah Fitter: it sounds like you might be limiting yourselves by assuming many dev groups use the same ToC, which might not be (or shouldn't be) the case, right?

Zaheer Ahmed: how you will categorize tp trend in region to region?


USAID Knowledge Driven Development: thank you Tulika, welcome

USAID Knowledge Driven Development: and thank you again to everyone for submitting your questions

Zaheer Ahmed: hi Tulika narayan

Danae Roumis: why not also classify confidence in the IEs?

John Waugh: does the position of the dots in the cell convey any kind of meaning?

Danae Roumis: (assuming some designs or models would be more convincing than others)

Nikola Balvin: If appropriate, would you mind telling me how much an evidence gap map typically costs, how long does it take to do and how specific does the research question need to be? Thanks.

Janice Stallard: Can you send everyone a link about how to get to the Evidence Gap Maps?

Jennifer Stevenson (London): John Waugh: the position of the dots does not convey any meaning, only the size which conveys the relative size of the evidence base and the colour to indicate whether an impact evaluation or systematic review (and it's quality)

Sophia van der Bijl: sorry if this was covered earlier, but where do you search for studies? AND, would it be possible to search by date?

Sophia van der Bijl: (date)

yejin oh: I love it - this is going to be so helpful. Esp. the filtering function. To keep it useful for the years to come, what is the plan is to keep this "up to date/dynamic" as we continue to build on the body of evidence

Jennifer Stevenson (London): The landing page for searching for 3ie gap maps can be found here: http://www.3ieimpact.org/en/evidence/gap-maps/
Jessica Ziegler: What are the prospects of using this tool to identify particular areas for meta evaluations across sectors?

Jennifer Stevenson (London): More information about evidence gap maps can be found here, including a link to a World Bank working paper: http://www.3ieimpact.org/evaluation/evidence-gap-maps/

Marissa Yeakey: Why did you choose to call this an "Evidence Gap Map" instead of just an "Evidence Map"? I can see that one effective use is highlighting gaps in the research, but the tool also highlights where there's a stronger body of evidence, and can be an effective tool to increase the use of the research we do have in policies and programs.

Laura Arntson: what possibility is there to pull summaries and assessments from different gap maps into a newly created gap map based on a particular theory of change or causal relationship?

Tulika Narayan: Where can we find the criteria by which the evidence gap map categorized the papers. This may have been covered earlier. Abt has a tool to assess non-RCT studies and we would like to know how their criteria differs from ours.

Zaheer Ahmed: i think this complicates way of analysis, can you explain the advantages of this framework?

Tulika Narayan: Or indeed how it is similar!

Marcus Jenal: Why did you focus on 'micro' enterprises, not private sector targeted interventions in general? There seems to be an assumption that micro-enterprises have a bigger impact.

Julie Peachey: How did you measure reduction in poverty, or effects on income?

Zaheer Ahmed: how can participate land right to reduce the poverty, because the population growth is also increasing

Julie Peachey: what do you think is the reason behind lack of focus on poverty status?

USAID Knowledge Driven Development: Lots of great questions coming in!

USAID Knowledge Driven Development: We will address questions soon!

USAID Knowledge Driven Development: keep those questions coming!

Jessica Högstrom: What are the sources of these impact evaluations and systematic reviews? Global? Comprehensive?

Aaron Dibner-Dunlap: Hi, Aaron from innovations for Poverty Action (IPA). Marcus, I think the focus on microenterprises is less due to lack of interest and more due to the fact that it is practically more difficult to generate rigorous evidence using medium or large enterprises as your unit of randomization.

Bescaye Diop: How many impact evaluations used Depth of Poverty to measure poverty or well being outcome

Amanda ONeil: You can find a lot of demographic information at USAID by contracting the GeoCenter people.
Tony Posnett: Further to Jessica’s question, what effort did/ could you make to gather evidence that might be available locally/ non peer reviewed/ not published?

Jennifer Stevenson (London): Jessica: we searched for any impact evaluations and systematic reviews covering these interventions based in any low or middle income country and that met our study design criteria. For IEs, we searched 19 academic databases and 26 grey literature sources. For systematic reviews we searched 14 academic databases and 15 grey lit sources.

Anne Hastings: Basically this one would conclude that we can’t really inform decision making at this point in time

Jennifer Stevenson (London): Tony: we included both published and unpublished papers

Kris merschrod: anne - that is a poor conclusion - hasty

Susan Davis: So who IS providing a critical synthesis of results?

Laura Arntson: Can systematic reviews in any one gap map be pulled in order to compile a new gap map?

Nicholas Demeter: can’t wait to see a gap map for Democracy and Governance : )

Marcus Jenal: Sorry, I missed the contact details, could you pull them up again somewhere?

Hannah Fitter: me too Nicholas!

Susan Davis: Would love to see one on evidence for water & sanitation interventions

Anna Haines: Does 3ie have a plan to update these map? If so how often

Kris merschrod: Wasn’t The NEC data used?

Hiren Nisar: Do you use criteria for judging an impact evaluation using the same criteria as IES uses (WWC certification)

Kris merschrod: sri DEC Development Experience Clearing House?


Susan Davis: Oh great Jennifer - thank you!

Susan Roers: Will the audio and visual of this webinar be available?

Tony Posnett: Have you any thoughts about 'open sourcing' this type of tocl? Would a sort of controlled wiki be possible to allow collaboration?

Anna Haines: How long did it take to complete the Safety net gap map?

USAID Knowledge Driven Development: Hello Susan, yes we will distribute a recording of this webinar

Marcus Jenal: Tony, great question, I second it!
Kris merschrod: Great on the recording - I will pass it on to academic folks

Nicholas Demeter: @ tina - when you ask partners to provide more detail about beneficiaries in their evaluations, is that an issue of cost, i.e. more detail equals more money, or is it a best practice and not directly related to cost of data collection?

Lola Hermosillo 2: What percentage of the impact evaluations don’t produce results or produce negative results?

Jennifer Stevenson (London): Anna - it took about 6 months to complete this gap map

Marcus Jenal: RCTs on the other hand have a very limited external validity which is a big problem for this type of work; you generalize on something that is not generalizable

Pramod Sharma: Bye it was good.

Jennifer Stevenson (London): Link to 3ie page with the checklist for appraising systematic reviews: http://www.3ieimpact.org/en/evidence/systematic-reviews/

Anand Manarkattu: Hello Martina, Tania and Jennifer; Thanks a lot for the presentation. I am gonna use some of this into my ongoing research. Bye

Todd Anderson: Thanks for a great presentation. Very informative. Signing off.

USAID Knowledge Driven Development: Thank you to everyone who joined!

Jennifer Stevenson (London): Thank you all for attending and for your engaging questions!

USAID Knowledge Driven Development: we will continue to answer questions until the webinar is done

Julie Peachey: thank you!

Kris merschrod: Please send the recording or URL for downloading it ASAP via email. I can’t copy text on the webinar screen.

USAID Knowledge Driven Development: Kris, we will distribute the recording soon.

madeleine thomson: Thanks - this was great - will be in touch.

Kris merschrod: Thank you this has been a great effort and great conceptual approach.

Zaheer Ahmed: Thanks it was good and helpful

Jennifer Stevenson (London): If people have follow up questions that do not get answered today, please email mvojtkova@3ieimpact.org

Natasha Kanagat: Thank you! This was fantastic.

Megnote Lezhnev: Thank you this is really great!

Gil Lacson: Indeed - thank you very much. Very useful presentation and website. We will keep in touch. Cheers from Women’s World Banking.
Marcus Jenal: Thank you, this was very interesting.
Kris merschrod: quick question. Was the DEC used as a data source?
Hannah Fitter: thanks from a DM&E grad student!
Shannon Howard: Can’t wait to play around with the tool. Very nice!
Susan Roers: Great webinar; look forward to going on the 3ie website!
Janice Stallard: Thank you so much for this presentation!
Stephanie Dimos: Thank you, this was very interesting!
Carolyn Ramsdell: Thank you all, great presentation!
Kris merschrod: super webinar - Thank you
John Solon: Thank you for a wonderful webinar.
USAID Knowledge Driven Development: Thank you everyone!!
Aaron Dibner-Dunlap: thanks everyone! Very useful!!
Tom Shaw: Great presentation and thank to you both.
Susan Davis: Thanks - interesting tool.
Tony Posnett: Thanks, really useful and interesting tool
Hiren Nisar: Thank you!! This was great.
John Waugh: Excellent. I look forward to more like this!
Devon Krainer: Thank you!
Jennifer Stevenson (London): Thank you everyone for attending and for your interesting questions!
Martina Vojtkovva (London): Indeed, thank you all for participating!